Supplemental material

Air pollution and cardiovascular mortality with over 25 years follow-up: A combined analysis of two British cohorts

Hakim-Moulay Dehbi, Marta Blangiardo, John Gulliver, Daniela Fecht, Kees de Hoogh, Zaina Al-Kanaani, Therese Tillin, Rebecca Hardy, Nish Chaturvedi, Anna L Hansell

Supplemental Figure 1: Histograms of air pollutants for SABRE and NSHD participants. (a): contemporaneous 1991 estimates. (b): ESCAPE 2010-11 estimates



Supplemental Table 1: Two-pollutant hazard ratios (HR) and 95% confidence intervals (CI), per increase of 10 μ g/m³ for the continuous variables, between air pollution exposure to BS + NO2 and SO2 + NO2 and CVD mortality (1989-2015). M1: model adjusted only for cohort to which the participant belongs. M4 (fully-adjusted model): M2 + age, gender, diabetes, smoking status, ethnicity, type of employment, 1991 Carstairs index and baseline CVD.

	# events / n (%)	M1: model adjusted for cohort only	M4: fully-adjusted model
$BS + NO_2$			
Continuous	(10 / 7500 (8 10/)	1.02 (0.00 (1.10)	0.07 (0.01 (1.10)
NO2	610 / 7529 (8.1%)	1.03 (0.90 to 1.19)	0.97 (0.81 to 1.16)
BS	610 / 7529 (8.1%)	1.67 (1.19 to 2.33)	1.11 (0.76 to 1.60)
Quartiles			
NO ₂ -q1:[18.2-31.4]	62 / 1974 (3.1%)	1	1
NO ₂ -q2:(31.4-44.4]	142 / 1909 (7.4%)	0.99 (0.70 to 1.40)	0.80 (0.54 to 1.18)
NO ₂ -q3:(44.4-46.6]	224 / 1868 (12.0%)	1.15 (0.78 to 1.71)	0.87 (0.56 to 1.34)
NO ₂ -q4:(46.6-67.9)	182 / 1778 (10.2%)	1.13 (0.77 to 1.66)	0.92 (0.59 to 1.43)
BS-q1:[0.08-11.2]	82 / 2000 (4.1%)	1	1
BS-q2:(11.2-12.5]	151 / 1776 (8.6%)	0.96 (0.71 to 1.28)	0.99 (0.73 to 1.34)
BS-q3:(12.5-14.9]	217 / 2182 (9.9%)	1.27 (0.96 to 1.69)	1.06 (0.79 to 1.44)
BS-q4:(14.9-27.2]	160 / 1581 (10.1%)	1.62 (1.22 to 2.14)	1.32 (0.98 to 1.79)
$SO_2 + NO_2$			
Continuous			
NO_2	610 / 7529 (8.1%)	1.03 (0.89 to 1.2)	0.97 (0.81 to 1.16)
SO_2	610 / 7529 (8.1%)	1.27 (1.13 to 1.42)	1.05 (0.91 to 1.22)
Quartiles			

NO ₂ -q1:[18.2-31.4]	62 / 1974 (3.1%)	1	1
NO ₂ -q2:(31.4-44.4]	142 / 1909 (7.4%)	0.89 (0.62 to 1.28)	0.77 (0.52 to 1.14)
NO ₂ -q3:(44.4-46.6]	224 / 1868 (12.0%)	0.88 (0.59 to 1.33)	0.72 (0.46 to 1.12)
NO ₂ -q4:(46.6-67.9)	182 / 1778 (10.2%)	1.01 (0.68 to 1.50)	0.87 (0.56 to 1.34)
SO ₂ -q1:[6.5-29.2]	60 / 1974 (3.0%))	1	1
SO ₂ -q2:(29.2-33.0]	113 / 1820 (6.2%)	1.07 (0.74 to 1.53)	0.93 (0.63 to 1.37)
SO ₂ -q3:(33.0-41.2]	213 / 2069 (10.3%)	1.67 (1.17 to 2.39)	1.30 (0.89 to 1.92)
SO ₂ -q4:(41.2-57.3)	224 / 1666 (13.4%)	1.81 (1.27 to 2.58)	1.17 (0.78 to 1.76)

Supplemental Table 2: Single-pollutant hazard ratios (HR) and 95% confidence intervals (CI), per increase of 10 μ g/m³ for the continuous variables, between air pollution exposure to BS, SO₂ and NO₂ and CVD mortality and morbidity (1989-2011) in SABRE. Fully-adjusted model: model adjusted for cohort, age, gender diabetes, smoking status, ethnicity, type of employment, 1991 Carstairs index and baseline CVD.

	# events / n (%)	Fully-adjusted model
Continuous		
NO_2	1412 / 4050 (34.9%)	0.97 (0.81 to 1.16)
SO_2	1412 / 4050 (34.9%)	1.05 (0.91 to 1.22)
BS	1412 / 4050 (34.9%)	1.11 (0.76 to 1.61)
Quartiles		
NO ₂ -q1:[22.1-44.6]	381 / 1015 (37.5%)	1
NO ₂ -q2:(44.6-45.8]	426 / 1073 (39.7%)	1.15 (0.99 to 1.32)
NO ₂ -q3:(45.8-48.8]	345 / 952 (36.2%)	1.09 (0.94 to 1.27)
NO ₂ -q4:(48.8-63.0)	260 / 1010 (25.7%)	0.91 (0.76 to 1.10)
SO ₂ -q1:[16.4-32.9]	276 / 1117 (24.7%))	1
SO ₂ -q2:(32.9-38.5]	371 / 1051 (35.3%)	1.19 (1.00 to 1.42)
SO ₂ -q3:(38.5-44.2]	398 / 978 (40.7%)	1.14 (0.94 to 1.38)
SO ₂ -q4:(44.2-52.5)	367 / 904 (40.6%)	1.14 (0.94 to 1.37)
BS-q1:[1.31-11.4]	254 / 1015 (25.0%)	1
BS-q2:(11.4-12.9]	394 / 1138 (34.6%)	1.16 (0.97 to 1.38)
BS-q3:(12.9-14.9]	440 / 1111 (39.6%)	1.08 (0.89 to 1.30)
BS-q4:(14.9-19.4]	324 / 786 (41.2%)	1.12 (0.92 to 1.36)

Supplemental Table 3: Single-pollutant hazard ratios (HR) and 95% confidence intervals (CI), per increase of 10 μ g/m³ for the continuous variables, between between ESCAPE air pollution estimates of NO₂, NO_x, PM₁₀, PM_{coarse}, PM_{2.5} and CVD mortality and morbidity (1989-2011) in SABRE. Fully-adjusted model: model adjusted for cohort, age, gender diabetes, smoking status, ethnicity, type of employment, 1991 Carstairs index and baseline CVD.

	# events / n (%)	Fully-adjusted model
Continuous		
NO_2	1233 / 3682 (33.5%)	0.96(0.89 to 1.05)
NO _x	1233 / 3682 (33.5%)	0.98(0.94 to 1.01)
PM_{10}	1233 / 3682 (33.5%)	0.97(0.72 to 1.31)
PM _{coarse}	1233 / 3682 (33.5%)	1.01(0.56 to 1.82)
PM _{2.5}	1233 / 3682 (33.5%)	0.54(0.26 to 1.13)
Quartiles		
NO ₂ -q1:[12.9-28.4]	297 / 933 (31.8%)	1
NO ₂ -q2:(28.4-30.7]	332 / 915 (36.3%)	1(0.84 to 1.18)
NO ₂ -q3:(30.7-32.6]	345 / 933 (37.0%)	1.05(0.89 to 1.24)
NO ₂ -q4:(32.6-91.8)	259 / 901 (28.7%)	0.95(0.8 to 1.14)
NO _x -q1:[19.7-40.9]	303 / 922 (32.9%))	1
NO _x -q2:(40.9-46.8]	304 / 920 (33.0%)	0.88(0.75 to 1.03)
NO _x -q3:(46.8-51.6]	336/921(36.5%)	0.95(0.81 to 1.12)
NO _x -q4:(51.6-242)	290 / 919 (31.6%)	0.94(0.79 to 1.11)
PM ₁₀ -q1:[11.8-16.5]	298 / 969 (30.8%)	1
PM ₁₀ -q2:(16.5-17.3]	296 / 893 (33.1%)	1.03(0.87 to 1.21)
PM ₁₀ -q3:(17.3-18.5]	346/930(37.2%)	1.05(0.89 to 1.25)
PM ₁₀ -q4:(18.5-25.8]	293 / 890 (32.9%)	1(0.85 to 1.18)
PM _{coarse} -q1:[5.6-6.3]	335 /1094 (30.6%)	1

PM _{coarse} -q2:(6.3-6.8]	229 / 747 (30.6%)	1.05(0.88 to 1.24)
PM _{coarse} -q3:(6.8-7.3]	374 / 938 (39.9%)	1.24(1.06 to 1.46)
PM _{coarse} -q4:(7.3-10.8]	295 / 903 (32.7%)	1.03(0.88 to 1.21)
PM _{2.5} -q1:[8.2-9.6]	331 / 960 (34.5%)	1
PM _{2.5} -q2:(9.6-10.0]	315 / 911 (34.6%)	0.99(0.84 to 1.16)
PM _{2.5} -q3:(10.0-10.5]	338 / 1009 (33.5%)	0.92(0.78 to 1.07)
PM _{2.5} -q4:(10.5-16.5]	249 / 802 (31.0%)	0.92(0.77 to 1.09)
	I	

Supplemental Table 4: Single-pollutant hazard ratios (HR) and 95% confidence intervals (CI), per increase of 10 μ g/m³ for the continuous variables, between air pollution exposure to BS, SO₂, NO₂ (contemporaneous 1991 estimates) and CVD mortality (1989-2015). Comparison of results between competing risk regression modelling and Cox modelling. M1: model adjusted only for cohort to which the participant belongs. M2: M1 + age, gender. M3: M2 + type of employment, 1991 Carstairs index. M4 (fully-adjusted model): M3 + diabetes, smoking status, ethnicity, baseline CVD.

	M1	M2	M3	M4
NO ₂				
Competing risk	1.03 (0.90 to 1.18)	1.06 (0.91 to 1.23)	0.94 (0.79 to 1.12)	0.97 (0.81 to 1.16)
Cox	1.04 (0.89 to 1.21)	1.06 (0.90 to 1.25)	0.94 (0.78 to 1.12)	0.96 (0.80 to 1.15)
SO_2				
Competing risk	1.27 (1.13 to 1.42)	1.19 (1.05 to 1.34)	1.07 (0.94 to 1.23)	1.05 (0.91 to 1.22)
Cox	1.27 (1.13 to 1.43)	1.18 (1.04 to 1.33)	1.06 (0.93 to 1.21)	1.05 (0.91 to 1.21)
BS				
Competing risk	1.66 (1.19 to 2.32)	1.44 (1.02 to 2.04)	1.16 (0.81 to 1.65)	1.11 (0.76 to 1.61)
Cox	1.66 (1.21 to 2.27)	1.42 (1.03 to 1.95)	1.13 (0.81 to 1.57)	1.09 (0.77 to 1.55)

Supplemental Table 5: Single-pollutant hazard ratios (HR) and 95% confidence intervals (CI), per increase of 10 μ g/m³ for the continuous variables, between ESCAPE 2010-11 air pollution estimates of NO₂, NO_x, PM₁₀, PM_{coarse}, PM_{2.5} and CVD mortality (1989-2015). Comparison of results between competing risk regression modelling and Cox modelling. M1: model adjusted only for cohort to which the participant belongs. M2: M1 + age, gender. M3: M2 + type of employment, 1991 Carstairs index. M4 (fully-adjusted model): M3 + diabetes, smoking status, ethnicity, baseline CVD.

	M1	M2	M3	M4
NO ₂				
Competing risk	1.06 (0.93 to 1.20)	1.10 (0.96 to 1.26)	1.00 (0.86 to 1.17)	1.03 (0.89 to 1.20)
Cox	1.06 (0.93 to 1.22)	1.12 (0.97 to 1.29)	1.02 (0.87 to 1.18)	1.04 (0.90 to 1.21)
NO _x				
Competing risk	1.01 (0.96 to 1.07)	1.03 (0.97 to 1.09)	1.00 (0.93 to 1.07)	1.01 (0.94 to 1.07)
Cox	1.01 (0.95 to 1.07)	1.04 (0.98 to 1.10)	1.00 (0.94 to 1.07)	1.01 (0.95 to 1.08)
PM_{10}				
Competing risk	1.28 (0.82 to 2.01)	1.36 (0.86 to 2.15)	1.12 (0.68 to 1.85)	1.16 (0.70 to 1.92)
Cox	1.29 (0.79 to 2.09)	1.40 (0.86 to 2.30)	1.14 (0.68 to 1.91)	1.13 (0.68 to 1.90)
PM _{coarse}				
Competing risk	1.02 (0.40 to 2.60)	1.12 (0.43 to 2.91)	0.82 (0.29 to 2.33)	0.89 (0.31 to 2.55)
Cox	1.03 (0.38 to 2.76)	1.19 (0.44 to 3.20)	0.85 (0.30 to 2.42)	0.90 (0.32 to 2.54)
PM _{2.5}				
Competing risk	1.52 (0.52 to 4.46)	2.10 (0.69 to 6.44)	1.15 (0.35 to 3.81)	1.30 (0.39 to 4.34)
Cox	1.52 (0.50 to 4.69)	2.28 (0.72 to 7.22)	1.20 (0.36 to 4.02)	1.17 (0.35 to 3.88)

Supplemental Table 6: Single-pollutant hazard ratios (HR) and 95% confidence intervals (CI), per increase of 10 μ g/m³ for the continuous variables, between air pollution exposure to BS, SO₂, NO₂ (contemporaneous 1991 estimates), between ESCAPE 2010-11 air pollution estimates of NO₂, NO_x, PM₁₀, PM_{coarse}, PM_{2.5}, and CVD mortality (1989-2015). M4 (fully-adjusted model): model adjusted for cohort, age, gender, type of employment, 1991 Carstairs index, diabetes, smoking status, ethnicity, baseline CVD.

	M4	M4 minus adjustment
		for diabetes and
		baseline CVD
Contemporaneous 1991		
estimates		
NO_2	0.97 (0.81 to 1.16)	0.99 (0.83 to 1.17)
SO_2	1.05 (0.91 to 1.22)	1.03 (0.89 to 1.19)
BS	1.11 (0.76 to 1.61)	1.11 (0.76 to 1.61)
ESCAPE 2010-11		
estimates		
NO_2	1.03 (0.89 to 1.20)	1.03 (0.89 to 1.21)
NO _x	1.01 (0.94 to 1.07)	1.01 (0.94 to 1.08)
PM_{10}	1.16 (0.70 to 1.92)	1.16 (0.70 to 1.91)
PM _{coarse}	0.89 (0.31 to 2.55)	0.88 (0.31 to 2.50)
PM _{2.5}	1.30 (0.39 to 4.34)	1.27 (0.38 to 4.28)