

Model inter-comparison between statistical and dynamic model assessments of the long-term stability of blanket peat in Great Britain (1940–2099)

**J. M. Clark^{1,2,3,*}, M. F. Billett⁴, M. Coyle⁴, S. Croft⁵, S. Daniels⁶, C. D. Evans⁷,
M. Evans⁸, C. Freeman², A. V. Gallego-Sala^{8,9}, A. Heinemeyer¹⁰, J. I. House⁸,
D. T. Monteith¹¹, D. Nayak¹², H. G. Orr¹³, I. C. Prentice^{8,14}, R. Rose¹¹, J. Rowson^{15,16},
J. U. Smith¹², P. Smith¹², Y. M. Tun⁷, E. Vanguelova¹⁷, F. Wetterhall¹⁸, F. Worrall¹⁵**

¹Grantham Institute for Climate Change Fellow, Civil and Environmental Engineering, Imperial College London, South Kensington, London SW7 2AZ, UK

²Wolfson Carbon Capture Laboratory, School of Biological Sciences, Bangor University, Environment Centre Wales, Deiniol Road, Bangor, Gwynedd LL57 2UW, UK

³Walker Institute for Climate Systems Research and Soils Research Centre, Department of Geography and Environmental Science, School of Human and Environmental Sciences, University of Reading, Whiteknights, PO Box 233, Reading RG6 6DW, UK

⁴Centre for Ecology and Hydrology (Edinburgh), Bush Estate, Penicuik, Midlothian EH26 0QB, UK

⁵Department of Mathematics, University of York, York YO10 5DD, UK

⁶Geography, School of Environment and Development, University of Manchester, Oxford Road, Manchester M13 9PL, UK

⁷Centre for Ecology and Hydrology (Bangor), Environment Centre Wales, Deiniol Road, Bangor, Gwynedd LL57 2UW, UK

⁸QUEST, Department of Earth Sciences, University of Bristol, Queen's Road, Bristol BS8 1HB, UK

⁹Department of Earth and Ecosystem Sciences, Division of Physical Geography and Ecosystem Analysis, University of Lund, Sölvegatan 12, 223 62 Lund, Sweden

¹⁰Centre for Terrestrial Carbon Dynamics at the Stockholm Environment Institute (York Centre), Environment Department, Grimston House, University of York, York YO10 5DD, UK

¹¹Environmental Change Network, Centre for Ecology and Hydrology (Lancaster), Lancaster Environment Centre, Library Avenue, Bailrigg, Lancaster LA1 4AP, UK

¹²Institute of Biological and Environmental Sciences, School of Biological Sciences, University of Aberdeen, 23 St Machar Drive, Aberdeen AB24 3UU, UK

¹³Science and Innovation (Climate Change), Environment Agency, Environment Centre Wales, Deiniol Road, Bangor, Gwynedd LL57 2UW, UK

¹⁴Grantham Institute for Climate Change, Division of Life Sciences, Imperial College London, Silwood Park, Ascot, Berkshire SL5 7PY, UK

¹⁵Department of Earth Sciences, Durham University, Science Laboratories, South Road, Durham DH1 3LE, UK

¹⁶Environmental and Geographical Sciences, Manchester Metropolitan University, Chester Street, Manchester M1 5GD, UK

¹⁷Forest Research, Alice Holt Lodge, Farnham, Surrey GU10 4LH, UK

¹⁸Department of Geography, King's College London, Strand, London WC2R 2LS, UK

*Email: j.m.clark@reading.ac.uk

Supplementary Information

Table S1. Detailed output for each model presented in Fig. 4, showing the number of dynamic models (DMs) predicting a net C sink and the number of bioclimatic envelope models (BCEMs) showing climate associated with blanket peat presence for raw Met Office/UKCIP gridded data. Output is in binary format, with 1 indicating a net C sink or blanket peat presence and 0 indicating a net C source or blanket peat absence

Field site	Model type	Model name	DM showing net C sink/BCEM showing climate associated with blanket peat presence			
			1940–1969	1950–1979	1960–1989	1970–1999
Auchencorth Moss	DM	MILLENNIA	1	1	1	1
		ECOSSE	1	1	1	1
		Durham	1	1	1	1
	BCEM	P50	0	0	0	0
		P65	0	0	0	0
		LM	1	0	1	1
		H-GLM	1	1	1	1
		BBOG	1	1	1	1
		BBOG-TREE	1	1	1	0
		BBOG-GLM	1	1	1	1
BBOG-GAM	1	1	1	1		
PEATSTASH	1	1	1	1		
Moor House	DM	MILLENNIA	1	1	1	1
		ECOSSE	1	1	1	1
		Durham	1	1	1	1
	BCEM	P50	1	1	1	1
		P65	1	1	1	1
		LM	1	1	1	1
		H-GLM	1	1	1	1
		BBOG	1	1	1	1
		BBOG-TREE	1	1	1	1
		BBOG-GLM	1	1	1	1
BBOG-GAM	1	1	1	1		
PEATSTASH	1	1	1	1		
Bleaklow	DM	MILLENNIA	1	1	1	1
		ECOSSE	1	1	1	1
		Durham	1	1	1	1
	BCEM	P50	0	0	0	0
		P65	0	0	0	0
		LM	1	1	1	1
		H-GLM	1	1	1	1
		BBOG	1	1	1	1
		BBOG-TREE	1	1	1	1
		BBOG-GLM	1	1	1	0
BBOG-GAM	1	1	1	1		
PEATSTASH	0	0	1	1		
Conwy	DM	MILLENNIA	0	0	0	0
		ECOSSE	1	0	0	0
		Durham	1	1	1	1
	BCEM	P50	1	1	1	1
		P65	1	1	1	1
		LM	1	1	1	1
		H-GLM	1	1	1	1
		BBOG	1	1	1	1
		BBOG-TREE	1	1	1	1
		BBOG-GLM	1	1	1	1
BBOG-GAM	1	1	1	1		
PEATSTASH	1	1	1	1		

Table S2. Detailed output for each model presented in Fig. 4, showing the number of dynamic models (DMs) predicting a net C sink and the number of bioclimatic envelope models (BCEMs) showing climate associated with blanket peat presence for bias corrected Met Office/UKCIP gridded data. Output is in binary format, with 1 indicating a net C sink or blanket peat presence and 0 indicating a net C source or blanket peat absence

Field site	Model type	Model name	DM showing net C sink/BCEM showing climate associated with blanket peat presence			
			1940–1969	1950–1979	1960–1989	1970–1999
Auchencorth Moss	DM	MILLENNIA	1	1	1	1
		ECOSSE	1	1	1	1
		Durham	1	1	1	1
	BCEM	P50	0	0	0	0
		P65	0	0	0	0
		LM	1	1	1	1
		H-GLM	1	1	1	1
		BBOG	1	1	1	1
		BBOG-TREE	1	1	1	0
		BBOG-GLM	1	1	1	1
BBOG-GAM	1	1	1	1		
PEATSTASH	1	1	1	1		
Moor House	DM	MILLENNIA	1	1	1	1
		ECOSSE	1	0	1	1
		Durham	1	1	1	1
	BCEM	P50	1	1	1	1
		P65	1	1	1	1
		LM	1	1	1	1
		H-GLM	1	1	1	1
		BBOG	1	1	1	1
		BBOG-TREE	1	1	1	1
		BBOG-GLM	1	1	1	1
BBOG-GAM	1	1	1	1		
PEATSTASH	1	1	1	1		
Bleaklow	DM	MILLENNIA	1	1	1	1
		ECOSSE	1	1	1	1
		Durham	1	1	1	1
	BCEM	P50	1	1	1	1
		P65	1	1	1	1
		LM	1	1	1	1
		H-GLM	1	1	1	1
		BBOG	1	1	1	1
		BBOG-TREE	1	1	1	1
		BBOG-GLM	1	1	1	1
BBOG-GAM	1	1	1	1		
PEATSTASH	1	1	1	1		
Conwy	DM	MILLENNIA	1	1	1	1
		ECOSSE	1	0	1	0
		Durham	1	1	1	1
	BCEM	P50	1	1	1	1
		P65	1	1	1	1
		LM	1	1	1	1
		H-GLM	1	1	1	1
		BBOG	1	1	1	1
		BBOG-TREE	1	1	1	1
		BBOG-GLM	1	1	1	1
BBOG-GAM	1	1	1	1		
PEATSTASH	1	1	1	1		

Table S3. Detailed output for each model presented in Fig. 7, showing the number of dynamic models (DMs) predicting a net C sink and the number of bioclimatic envelope models (BCEMs) predicting blanket peat presence for bias corrected 11-RCM ensemble data. Output shows the number of models predicting a net C sink or blanket peat presence from the 11 different climate projections from the 11-RCM ensemble

Field site	Model type	Model name	DM showing net C sink/BCEM showing climate associated with blanket peat presence												
			1950–1979	1960–1989	1970–1999	1980–2009	1990–2019	2000–2029	2010–2039	2020–2049	2030–2059	2040–2069	2050–2079	2060–2089	2070–2099
Auchencorth Moss	DM	MILLENNIA	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11
		ECOSSE	11	11	10	11	11	8	7	9	10	10	10	4	5
		Durham	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11
	BCEM	P50	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
		P65	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
		LM	5	5	5	6	6	6	6	4	3	2	0	0	0
		H-GLM	11	11	11	11	11	11	10	7	4	3	2	2	0
		BBOG	10	10	10	10	9	9	8	8	8	6	6	6	6
		BBOG-TREE	7	9	9	8	9	8	8	8	7	5	6	4	3
		BBOG-GLM	10	11	11	10	5	3	3	1	0	0	0	0	0
BBOG-GAM	8	9	8	7	3	3	1	0	0	0	0	0	0		
PEATSTASH	10	10	10	9	8	8	6	4	3	1	1	0	0		
Moor House	DM	MILLENNIA	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11
		ECOSSE	11	11	11	10	9	8	4	3	3	2	0	0	0
		Durham	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11
	BCEM	P50	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11
		P65	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11
		LM	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	10	9	7	4	3
		H-GLM	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	7	5
		BBOG	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	10	10	9	8	8	8
		BBOG-TREE	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	10	10	7	8	8	8
		BBOG-GLM	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	10	9	9	6	5
BBOG-GAM	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	10	9	9	8	5		
PEATSTASH	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	10	7	5	2	2		
Bleaklow	DM	MILLENNIA	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11
		ECOSSE	11	11	11	11	11	9	11	10	10	11	8	3	4
		Durham	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11
	BCEM	P50	7	7	7	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	8
		P65	6	7	7	8	6	6	5	5	2	1	1	1	1
		LM	11	11	11	11	11	11	10	7	5	2	2	0	0
		H-GLM	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	10	6	4	3

		BBOG	9	10	10	10	8	8	8	8	8	6	6	5	3	
		BBOG-TREE	10	10	10	10	10	8	7	5	6	5	5	3	2	
		BBOG-GLM	11	11	11	11	11	10	7	6	3	2	1	0	0	
		BBOG-GAM	11	11	11	11	11	10	9	8	6	3	2	1	1	
		PEATSTASH	11	11	11	11	10	11	11	8	6	3	1	2	0	
Conwy	DM	MILLENNIA	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11
		ECOSSE	9	9	6	4	3	1	1	1	1	1	1	0	0	0
		Durham	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	10	10	10	10
	BCEM	P50	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11
		P65	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11
		LM	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	10	10	7	4	2	0
		H-GLM	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	8	4	3	2	2
		BBOG	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	10	10	10	8	8	8	8
		BBOG-TREE	11	11	11	11	11	8	10	8	8	8	8	8	8	8
		BBOG-GLM	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	10	9	9	6	3
		BBOG-GAM	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	11	10	9	8	7	3
		PEATSTASH	11	11	11	11	10	9	7	5	4	2	1	0	0	